

**MARIEMONT ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
REGULAR MEETING
AUGUST 19, 2013**

Mr. Bruggeman called the meeting to order at 5:38 p.m. Present were Mr. Stegman, Mr. Allen, Mr. Thomas (arrived 5:50 p.m.) and Ms. Stalzer. Also in attendance was Building Commissioner Kirk Hodulik.

The first request was from Mr. Chad Osgood (of Harlyn 6 LLC located at 3940 Beech Street, Mariemont, Ohio 45227) to make proposed improvements to 6776, 6778, 6780 & 6782 Chestnut Street, Mariemont, Ohio 45227 for a Certificate of Appropriateness. Proposed work will include:

- A. Removal of concrete slab patios and brick patios
- B. Removal of chain link fence between properties and at back property line along Lane H
- C. Install new wood frame stucco finish privacy walls 6 feet by 14 feet long at (3) locations
- D. Install new hard surface (concrete over paver) patios 14 feet out from back wall of structure and full width of properties with brakes between at new privacy walls

Mr. Osgood said basically he is starting over with the noted properties. It is a big project and a lot of money but he feels it will be well worth it. He is going with the black aluminum iron look between the yards and along the back of the properties. He is hoping to have parking spaces behind two of the town homes. He went over the plans with the members of the ARB and answered questions. Mr. Stegman moved, seconded by Mr. Allen to approve the request. Mr. Bruggeman abstained from the vote due to a conflict of interest. On roll call; three ayes, no nays.

The second request was from Ms. Barbara Gray Hall and Matt Borneman, 1 Linden Place, Mariemont, Ohio 45227 for a Certificate of Appropriateness for:

- A. Re-roofing with a black shingle in lieu of gray shingles and repainting the front door and shutters black in lieu of the dark green (which is similar to the Historic District's approved color of Mallard Green)
- B. Changing the front, one-story front entry/porch projection exterior cladding from clapboard siding to a stone veneer with new slate cladding on front entry stoop & step
- C. Painting chimney white to match rest of residence
- D. Replacing 6 foot high privacy fence to left of residence with aesthetically attractive lattice fence

Ms. Hall said presently they have a Kelly green shutter and the request is to make it black along with the front door. In addition, they would like to paint the chimney white to compliment the house. They are requesting permission to change what had been a screen porch at one time to make it stone veneer to add more personality. The hope is by replacing the exiting fence with a lattice fence it will be more aesthetically appealing.

Building Commissioner Hodulik said he received a letter from Dr. Ann Grooms, 6576 Wooster Pike, who indicated that she did not have any objections with this request or the request made by Mr. Osgood.

Ms. Hall went over the site plans with the members of ARB and answered questions.

Mr. Stegman said complying with historic regulations is part of what comes with having a historic home. He asked what the reasoning was for the black roof. Ms. Hall said to compliment the shutters and the door and to give the house more personality. It creates a more holistic look. Mr. Stegman asked if there are any color guidelines for the street. Building Commissioner Hodulik said not that he is aware of. Ms. Hall said the front stoop will be slate which will compliment the stone so it is in the same color pallet. Mr. Stegman said part of their charge is to look at historic uniformity of the houses on a street. These are all wood clapboard sided Dutch Colonial / Cottage Revival houses. He has a problem with the stone veneer with a street where it has all clapboard sided houses. He asked how that was chosen. Ms. Hall said she did a landscape study online of Dutch Colonial houses and there are a number that included stone and that is where she got her inspiration. It will add uniqueness to the house.

Mr. Allen said he had not had a chance to drive by the house. Ms. Stalzer asked if any of the neighbors voiced any objection. Ms. Stalzer said she thinks the house is darling and thinks it will certainly improve the residence with the black addition - especially the fence will look better.

Mr. Bruggeman said the board is made up of ordinary neighborhood residents. Their charge is to look at a project and see how they fit into the community as they know it. We review properties that have already been through professional evaluation as far as historical integrity based on their features. The houses that ARB has under their jurisdiction are really for the most part of a grouping of houses. Linden Place is a neat cul-de-sac. Mariemont is filled with groups of housing developed by different architects. In his opinion the stone is not a fit to the neighborhood. The stone elsewhere throughout the Village is independent of this discussion. The houses on Linden Place set the standard in that area. To him the stone is problematic.

Ms. Hall said 'problematic' is a strong word. Stone is not uncommon and is not foreign in the Village. It is common aesthetically. It is used commonly in New England as a historic footprint and it is not foreign to Dutch Colonial housing. It is very attractive. It celebrates what makes a house a cottage. It gives some personality and presence that make it special while celebrating the clapboard siding. She asked for the Board to reconsider because it is complimentary and it is not foreign material.

Mr. Stegman said he appreciates Ms. Hall's research but he agrees with Mr. Bruggeman's comments and has a problem with the stone.

Mr. Allen suggested changing the concept and bringing back something that looks like it fits better into the rest of the grouping and that it could have looked that way when originally built. He does not feel ARB is going to approve the stone as it is today.

Mr. Thomas said he does not think the stone is an appropriate façade for the house.

Ms. Hall said she believes the stone still celebrates an authentic cottage look. She asked for them to reconsider because once paired with the black doors, shutters and soft gray would be very attractive.

Mr. Bruggeman said the ARB is working with context of the existing Linden Place houses and are charged with standards of the Village. The standard for the house is set by the neighboring homes. The vision was established with the architect in the 1930's. The Board was established to maintain Mariemont as it was and maintain the Village standards.

Building Commissioner Hodulik suggested to the Board and Ms. Hall to consider a compromise of a stone base porch with columns that are stone. It would not be out of precedent for Dutch Colonial to have some stone modified with some wood clapboard siding around the windows. In this way the stone would not be such a strong element.

Mr. Bruggeman said where he is coming from is he wants the house to look like its neighbors. The neighbors are clapboard not stone.

Mr. Thomas said it is the responsibility of ARB to make sure that this group of buildings continues to look as they were originally designed and built. The stone is not an appropriate use for the group of buildings.

Ms. Hall said she would appreciate knowing how you can put a unique thumbprint on the house. Mr. Allen said that is the catch - that is not supposed to happen.

Mr. Bruggeman said the whole standards are based on that improvements are within the spirit and subjectively in appearance with the other houses in the group. The stone does not meet the local standard spirit of neighborhood.

Mr. Stegman moved, seconded by Mr. Allen to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness except for the stone veneer façade. On roll call; five ayes, no nays.

Mr. Stegman moved, seconded by Mr. Bruggeman to approve the minutes as written for April 15, 2013. On roll call; five ayes, no nays.

Mr. Bruggeman moved, seconded by Mr. Stegman to appoint Mr. Allen as Secretary to fill the vacancy left by Ms. Schwartz. On roll call; five ayes, no nays.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:20 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Mr. Paul Allen
Secretary